

# Screening of seaweeds in the East China Sea as potential bio-monitors of heavy metals

Yaoru Pan, Thomas Wernberg, Thibaut de Bettignies, Marianne Holmer, Ke

Li, Jiaping Wu, Fang Lin, Yan Yu, Jiang Xu, Chaosheng Zhou, et al.

## ► To cite this version:

Yaoru Pan, Thomas Wernberg, Thibaut de Bettignies, Marianne Holmer, Ke Li, et al.. Screening of seaweeds in the East China Sea as potential bio-monitors of heavy metals. Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 2018, 25 (17), pp.16640-16651. 10.1007/s11356-018-1612-3. mnhn-04274152

## HAL Id: mnhn-04274152 https://mnhn.hal.science/mnhn-04274152

Submitted on 2 Apr 2024

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



### Screening of seaweeds in the East China Sea as potential bio-monitors of heavy metals

Pan, Yaoru; Wernberg, Thomas; de Bettignies, Thibaut; Holmer, Marianne; Li, Ke; Wu, Jiaping; Lin, Fang; Yu, Yan; Xu, Jiang; Zhou, Chaosheng; Huang, Zhixing; Xiao, Xi

Published in: **Environmental Science and Pollution Research** 

DOI: 10.1007/s11356-018-1612-3

Publication date: 2018

Document version: Accepted manuscript

Citation for pulished version (APA):

Pan, Y., Wernberg, T., de Bettignies, T., Holmer, M., Li, K., Wu, J., Lin, F., Yu, Y., Xu, J., Zhou, C., Huang, Z., & Xiao, X. (2018). Screening of seaweeds in the East China Sea as potential bio-monitors of heavy metals. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, *25*(17), 16640–16651. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-018-1612-3

Go to publication entry in University of Southern Denmark's Research Portal

#### Terms of use

This work is brought to you by the University of Southern Denmark. Unless otherwise specified it has been shared according to the terms for self-archiving. If no other license is stated, these terms apply:

- · You may download this work for personal use only.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
  You may freely distribute the URL identifying this open access version

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details and we will investigate your claim. Please direct all enquiries to puresupport@bib.sdu.dk

- 1 Screening of seaweeds in the East China Sea as potential bio-monitors of heavy metals

3	Yaoru Pan <sup>1</sup> , Thomas Wernberg <sup>2</sup> , Thibaut de Bettignies <sup>3</sup> , Marianne Holmer <sup>4</sup> , Ke Li <sup>1</sup> , Jiaping Wu <sup>1</sup> , Fang
4	Lin <sup>1</sup> , Yan Yu <sup>1</sup> , Jiang Xu <sup>5</sup> , Chaosheng Zhou <sup>6</sup> , Zhixing Huang <sup>6</sup> , Xi Xiao* <sup>1</sup>
5	
6	<sup>1</sup> Institute of Island and Coastal Ecosystem, Ocean College, Zhejiang University, 1 Zheda Road,
7	Zhoushan, Zhejiang 316000, China
8	<sup>2</sup> UWA Oceans Institute and School of Plant Biology, University of Western Australia, 35 Stirling
9	Highway, Crawley, WA 6009, Australia
10	<sup>3</sup> Service du Patrimoine Naturel, Museum National d'Histoire Naturelle, 57 Rue Cuvier, Paris 75005,
11	France
12	<sup>4</sup> Department of Biology, University of Southern Denmark, Campusvej 55, 5230 Odense M, Denmark
13	<sup>5</sup> Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh 15213,
14	USA
15	<sup>6</sup> Marine Aquaculture Research Institute of Zhejiang Province, 6-1 Hetong Bridge, Wenzhou, Zhejiang
16	325005, China
17	
18	Corresponding author: Xi Xiao, E-mail: prana@zju.edu.cn
19	Telephone: +86-15088785518
20	Fax: +86-0580 2092891
21	
22	

23	Abstract: Seaweeds are good bio-monitors of heavy metal pollution and have been included in
24	European coastal monitoring programs. However, data for seaweed species in China are scarce or
25	missing. In this study, we explored the potential of seaweeds as bio-monitor by screening the natural
26	occurring seaweeds in the "Kingdom of seaweed and shellfish" at Dongtou Islands, the East China Sea.
27	Totally, 12 seaweed species were collected from six sites, with richness following the sequence of
28	Rhodophyta > Phaeophyta > Chlorophyta. The concentration of heavy metals (Cu, Cr, Ni, Zn, Pb, Cd,
29	As) in the seaweeds were determined, and the bioaccumulation coefficient was calculated. A
30	combination of four seaweeds, Pachydictyon coriaceum, Gelidium divaricatum, Sargassum thunbergii,
31	and Pterocladiella capillacea, were proposed as bio-monitors due to their high bioaccumulation
32	capabilities of specific heavy metals in the East China Sea, and hence hinted the importance of using
33	seaweed community for monitoring of pollution rather than single species. Our results provide first
34	hand data for the selection of bio-monitor species for heavy metals in the East China Sea and contribute
35	to selection of cosmopolitan bio-monitor communities over geographical large area, which will benefit
36	the establishment of monitoring programs for coastal heavy metal contamination.
37	Keyword: seaweed; heavy metal; East China Sea; richness; bio-monitor; bioaccumulation coefficient
38	
39	1. Introduction
40	Heavy metals released from anthropogenic activities are affecting the coastal systems increasingly
41	(Elsikaily et al. 2011; Gao and Chen 2012; Tamilselvan et al. 2013). The fact that heavy metals in
42	coastal waters are persistent with no degradation opened the opportunity of identifying bio-monitors
43	that denotes an anthropogenic impact (Reis et al. 2011). Bio-monitor needs to fulfill certain required
44	characteristics including sedentary nature, widespread distribution with considerable biomass, easy to

45	identify etc., in addition to being pollutants accumulators (Rainbow 1995). Seaweeds are therefore
46	considered to be good agents for bio-monitoring of heavy metals in seawater (Akcali and Kucuksezgin
47	2011; Chaudhuri et al. 2007; Murphy et al. 2007). By now, in Europe, seaweeds have been included as
48	key organisms to classify and monitor the ecological status of coastal ecosystems with decades of
49	studies (Reis et al. 2014; Viana et al. 2010), as documented in the European Water Framework
50	Directive (Ballesteros et al. 2007; Juanes et al. 2008). For instance, the seaweed Alaria esculenta in
51	Irish coast was suggested to be used in the European Real-Time Environmental Monitoring Networks,
52	because of its accumulation efficiency of heavy metal contamination (As, Cd, Cu, Fe, Hg, Pb, and Zn)
53	(Reis et al. 2016).
54	Compared to progress made on Western world seaweed species, much less is known for their
55	Eastern relatives, despite the need to identify cosmopolitan bio-monitor to allow intra-specific
56	comparisons of bio-availabilities between geographical areas (Rainbow 1995). The bio-monitoring
57	potential of seaweed species from the Eastern world include a few case-studies from China (Caixue et
58	al. 2010; Zhang et al. 2014), India (Chakraborty et al. 2014; Kumar et al. 2009), and Russia
59	(Khristoforova and Kozhenkova 2002). For instance, brown algae (Padina gymnospora and Dictyota
60	bartayresiana) and green algae (Ulva lactuca and Enteromorpha intestinalis) in the Gulf of Kutch
61	(India) were suggested as bio-monitors for Cd, Ni, Cr, Cu, Zn and Pb (Chakraborty et al. 2014), as well
62	as Gracilaria conferuoides in the Liusha Bay of South China Sea for As, Cu, Pb, Cr and Fe (Caixue et
63	al. 2010), Cladophoropsis zollingeri for Fe in the mangrove area of South China Sea (Zhang et al.
64	2014). The lack of investigation of seaweed potential as bio-monitor for heavy metal in China is
65	surprising, taking into account that 47% of the world's seaweed production is derived from China
66	(FAO 2017) representing a high biodiversity (Ding et al. 2011). Indeed, there is a need for screening

67 the native seaweed species for potential use as bio-monitors in future.

68	Furthermore, large-scale seaweed aquaculture has been proved to be an important way of nutrient
69	reduction in coastal water in China due to high nitrogen and phosphorus removal capacity (Xiao et al.
70	2017). Investigating the heavy metal concentrations of seaweed tissues will benefit the potential
71	application of seaweeds as bio-monitor of coastal heavy metal contaminations. In addition, seaweed
72	composition could also reflect and monitor the ecological status of coastal environments (Diez et al.
73	2009; Paraskevi et al. 2015; Pinedo et al. 2007). For instance, in the Northwestern Mediterranean,
74	healthy coastal ecosystems were dominated by dense Cystoseira forests, comparing to those comprised
75	by Ulva spp. and other green algae (Pinedo et al. 2007). In Hainan Island of China, seaweed species
76	richness and composition were found closely related to a pollution gradient (Li et al. 2016).
77	Therefore, we conducted a survey in Dongtou Islands of the East China Sea, the so-called
78	"kingdom of seaweed and shellfish" of China for its rich seaweed biodiversity. The objectives of this
79	study are to (i) investigate the seaweed richness, (ii) quantify the seaweed tissue heavy metal
80	concentrations, and (iii) calculate the bioaccumulation coefficient for heavy metals for
81	cross-comparisons between seaweed species. Our study aims to fill the knowledge gap of biodiversity
82	and bio-monitoring potential of seaweeds in East China Sea, as well as to bring new insights into a
83	bio-monitoring program for heavy metal pollution in Chinese coastal waters.
84	
85	2. Materials and methods
86	2.1 Study area
87	Dongtou Islands (120°59'45" E~121°15'58" E, 27°41'19" N~28°01'10" N), located in the East
88	China Sea (China), has subtropical marine monsoon climate. Annual seawater salinity in Dongtou

89	Islands ranges from 27 to 35 ‰. Annual average water temperature is 18.4 °C, where February has
90	minimum temperature with average monthly water temperature of 8.5 °C, and August has maximum
91	temperature with average monthly water temperature of 27.9 °C. The average tidal range is about 4.5 m.
92	The seaweed community in this area is diverse due to the unique regional geographical and
93	oceanographic conditions. This region is climatically influenced from the Taiwan warm ocean current,
94	and is affected by Oujiang River.
95	2.2 Sampling
96	Seaweeds were collected from six sites in the Dongtou Islands (Fig. 1) during low tide period of
97	May, 2015. Sites 1-4 were located nearshore on the main island, and sites 5-6 were located in open sea.
98	Site 1 and site 2 are close to fishery harbor and village, which are influenced by heavier pressure of
99	human activity compared to the other sites. Seaweeds were collected from the intertidal and subtidal
100	zone by free diving. The seaweed samples were carefully washed at the sampling site with seawater to
101	remove the epiphytic organisms and trapped sediment, stored in polyethylene bags containing seawater,
102	and then transferred to the laboratory in portable cooler at 4 °C.
103	2.3 Seaweed identification
104	In the lab, the samples were washed with tap water and rinsed with Milli-Q water (Millipore,
105	Milli-Q Advantage A10, France) and then wiped with dry towels. Sampled seaweeds were identified
106	and classified based on their morphological features including the size, shape and color.
107	2.4 Chemical analysis
108	After the identification, the samples were dried at 60 °C for 48 h. The concentrations of heavy
109	metals in seaweed samples were determined by inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometry
110	(ICP-MS, Agilent, 7900, USA) for Cu, Cr, Ni, Zn, Pb, Cd and As (Caixue et al. 2010; La Rocha et al.

111	2009). For the detection of Cu, Cr, Ni, Zn, Pb, Cd and As, the dried samples were homogenized in an
112	agate mortar and reduced to a fine powder after sieving (200 $\mu$ m) (Caixue et al. 2010), and then
113	digested by microwaving (LabTech, ETHOS UP, Italy) with 7 ml 65 $\%$ nitric acid and 1 ml 30 $\%$
114	hydrogen peroxide; all the reagents used during procedure were of analytical grade (Caixue et al. 2010;
115	Kamalakannan et al. 2008). The digestion steps were as follows: (i) 0.2 MPa, 4 min; (ii) 0.5 MPa, 2
116	min; (iii) 0.8 MPa, 2 min; (iv) 1.0 MPa, 2 min; (v) 1.2 MPa, 2 min; (vi) 1.5 MPa, 5 min (Caixue et al.
117	2010). The solution was transferred into a 50 ml volumetric flask and diluted with Milli-Q waters
118	(Millipore, Milli-Q Advantage A10, France). Laver (35 g, Chinese National Standard Material No.
119	GBW 10023), from the Institute of Geophysical and Geochemical Exploration, Chinese Academy of
120	Geological Science, was used as certified reference material (Duan et al. 2015; Jiang et al. 2009; Wang
121	et al. 2014). Three replicate detections were performed on the certified reference material. Analytical
122	blanks were run in the similar way as that of the samples (Kamalakannan et al. 2008). The recovery of
123	the procedures was checked using the certified reference material (Giusti 2001). The detection results
124	of certified reference material (Laver) by ICP-MS method proved the reliability of the detections for
125	Cu, Cr, Ni, Zn, Pb, Cd and As (Table 1).
126	2.5 Bioaccumulation coefficient
127	The annual mean concentrations of heavy metals in seawater in Dongtou Islands in 2015 were
128	derived from the bulletin of coastal environment released by the Ministry of Environment Protection,
129	China (MEP 2015). The seawater quality monitoring frequency is two to three times a year in March to
130	May, July to August and October for in total 301 coastal water quality monitoring stations in China.
131	The seawater sampling and detection method followed the technical specification for offshore
132	environmental monitoring by Ministry of Environmental Protection (HJ442-2008, (MEP 2008)). The

- seawater monitoring data from the monitoring site (NO. ZJ0304, E: 121.2100, N: 27.8144), which is
- 134 close to the study area, was used to calculate the bioaccumulation coefficient in the seaweeds. The
- 135 concentration of Zn in seawater was below the detection limit of Zn ( $6.4 \mu g/L$ ) (MEP 2008). The
- 136 bioaccumulation coefficient was calculated as the ratio of the seaweed tissue concentration to the
- 137 concentration in the coastal waters.
- **138** 2.6 Statistical analysis
- 139 Principal component analysis (PCA) of tissue heavy metal concentrations in seaweed was
- 140 performed in MATLAB (version 2016a). The concentrations of Cu, Cr, Ni, Zn, Pb, Cd and As were
- 141 used as discriminating variables. Cluster analysis of tissue heavy metal concentrations in seaweed was
- 142 performed by the Ward grouping method using SPSS (version 20). p < 0.05 was considered as
- significant.
- 144 3. Result and discussion
- 145 3.1 Richness of natural seaweed species
- 146 In this study, we investigated the seaweed species distributed in Dongtou Islands in summer.
- 147 Totally 12 seaweed species were found at the sampling sites (Table 2), belonging to three phyla -
- 148 Phaeophyta (brown algae), Rhodophyta (red algae) and Chlorophyta (green algae). Two additional
- samples of Gracilaria lemaneiformis and Ulva pertusa were collected from floating seaweed
- 150 cultivation raft. Rhodophyta showed highest richness in this survey, accounting for 59% of all the
- species, followed by Phaeophyta (33%) and Chlorophyta (8%). Sargassum fusiforme, Sargassum
- 152 thunbergii and Chondracanthus intermedius were found in both intertidal and sublittoral zone, from
- 153 -1.0 m to 1 m (Fig. 2). Sargassum vachellianum, Pachydictyon coriaceum, Ahnfeltiopsis flabelliformis,
- 154 Laurencia tropica and Pterocladiella capillacea were confined to the sublittoral zone, which was no

more than 2.0 m deep (Fig. 2). *Polyopes polyideoides* and *Gelidium divaricatum* were restricted to the
intertidal zone (Fig. 2).

157	Seaweed species richness increased significantly from offshore to the sea (Table 2, Fig. 1), which
158	is similar to patterns reported from the South China Sea (Li et al. 2016). However, the seaweed species
159	richness in our study was higher in site 3 and 4 located on the main island comparing to the uninhabited
160	islands (site 5 and 6), which contradicts to the SW Atlantic, where coastal urbanization was found to
161	lead to seaweed species loss and shifts in community structure (Scherner et al. 2013). A possible
162	explanation is that nutrient inputs (i.e. domestic sewage) stimulated the growth of seaweeds on the
163	coasts and increased the complexity of seaweed community composition. Several seaweed species
164	appeared in a list of economic important seaweeds in the East China Sea about half a century ago,
165	including Sargassum fusiforme, Sargassum thunbergii, Gelidium divaricatum and Ulva pertusa
166	suggesting that these species have been present in historic times (Tseng and Chang 1959). Due to lack
167	of earlier documents in the region, it's difficult to evaluate potential changes of seaweed richness and
168	composition over time emphasizing the need for baseline studies to be used for future research on
169	regional marine ecosystem in response to global changes and human activities.
170	
171	3.2 Heavy metal comparison on the phylum level
172	3.2.1 Phaeophyta
173	Phaeophyta has the highest concentrations of Cd (4.59 mg/kg DW) and As (44.02 mg/kg DW)
174	among all seaweeds, and equal concentrations of Cr (2.25 $\pm$ 0.10 mg/kg DW) and Pb (1.95 $\pm$ 0.10
175	mg/kg DW) compared to Rhodophyta and Chlorophyta (Fig. 3). Similar to our study, Phaeophyta was
176	found to absorb or accumulate significantly higher concentrations of Cd (Mata et al. 2009; Schintu et al.

177	2010) and As (Malea and Kevrekidis 2014; Ryan et al. 2012) compared to Rhodophyta and
178	Chlorophyta from seawater. In general, brown seaweeds are resistant to marine pollutions (Costa et al.
179	2016) and at the same time, brown seaweeds have been proven to be effective and predictable in the
180	biosorption of Pb from aqueous solutions (Davis et al. 2003). More specifically, Sargassum filipendula
181	(Luna et al. 2010) and Macrocystis pyrifera (Cazon et al. 2012) showed high efficiency in biosorbing
182	Cd. Similarly, Lessonia nigrescens - a brown seaweed in the Chilean coast - absorbed both Cd and As
183	from sea water (Gutierrez et al. 2015; Hansen et al. 2006), and Fucus vesiculosus had been found to
184	bioaccumulate heavy metals in estuaries and coastal waters throughout northwest Europe (Varma et al.
185	2011).
186	Our results suggest that in the East China Sea, Phaeophyta can be used as bio-monitor of Cd and
187	As pollution. Indeed, various brown algae have been proposed as bio-monitors, including Fucus
188	spiralis for Cd contamination in the northwest coast of Portugal (Reis et al. 2014), Padina pavonica
189	(Schintu et al. 2010) and Cystoseira (Kravtsova et al. 2015) for both Cd and Pb contamination in the
190	Mediterranean Sea and the Black Sea, respectively, and Cystoseira barbata for Fe, Mn and Zn in
191	Aegean Sea (Aydın-Önen and Öztürk 2017).
192	3.2.2 Rhodophyta
193	Concentrations of Cu (20.66 mg/kg DW) and Zn (60.89 mg/kg DW) in Rhodophyta were
194	significantly higher than those of Phaeophyta and Chlorophyta (Fig. 3) suggesting potential use of
195	Rhodophyta as bio-monitor of Cu and Zn pollutions in the East China Sea. Similar to this study,
196	Rhodophyta was an effective adsorbent or accumulator for Cu and Zn, i.e. Pterocladia capillacea for
197	Cu (Elsikaily et al. 2011), Polysiphonia lanosa for Zn (Ryan et al. 2012), and Gymnogongrus torulosus
198	for Cu and Zn (Areco and Dos 2010). Interestingly, Rhodophyta in the Gulf of Kutch were found to

199	accumulate less	Cu and Zn c	ompared to	Phaeophyta and	Chlorophyta (	Chakraborty	et al. 2014),
-----	-----------------	-------------	------------	----------------	---------------	-------------	---------------

- 200 indicating that heavy metal accumulation in seaweeds is complex and regional scale study is needed
- 201 before using the seaweed as bio-monitor in a specific area (Fig. 3, Table 3). Furthermore, Rhodophyta
- 202 was found that it had effective biosorption capacity of Pb (Ibrahim 2011), i.e. Chondracanthus
- 203 chamissoi (Yipmantin et al. 2011), Gracilaria corticata varcartecala and Grateloupia lithophila
- 204 (Tamilselvan et al. 2013).

205 3.2.3 Chlorophyta

- 206 Chlorophyta has the highest concentration of Ni (7.14 mg/kg DW) (Fig. 3), which suggests
- 207 potential use as bio-monitor for Ni pollution in the East China Sea, consistent with investigations of
- 208 Chaetromorpha aerea in the Arabian Gulf (Alhomaidan 2008) and Ulva reticulata in India
- 209 (Vijayaraghavan et al. 2005). Similar to this study, Chlorophyta were good bio-monitors of Pb, i.e.
- 210 Ulva lactuca (Figueira et al. 2016) and Caulerpa lentillifera (Pavasant et al. 2006). Furthermore, the
- capacity of biosorption or bioaccumulation of Cu and Zn was highlighted for Chlorophyta, i.e.
- 212 Helimeda gracilis (Jayakumar et al. 2015), Chaetomorpha linum (Ajjabi and Chouba 2009), and Ulva
- sp. and *Enteromorpha* sp. (Akcali and Kucuksezgin 2011).

214 The uptake behaviors of heavy metals are also different through the three seaweed phyla, which

- will help to explain why these seaweed phyla showed dramatically different pattern of heavy metal
- accumulation in addition to the species specific favor of metals of seaweeds (He and Chen 2014;
- 217 Sawidis et al. 2001). Similar to our suspicion, a study on the distribution of rare earth elements (REE)
- and silicon in seaweed showed that the uptake behavior of these elements dramatically differed in
- green, red, and brown algae. In details, the REE patterns similar to that of suspended particles for the
- 220 green and red algae, but patterns closer to that of seawater solutions and relatively lower Si

- concentration for the brown algae (Fu et al. 2000).
- 222 3.3 Analysis on the species level
- 223 3.3.1 Principal component analysis (PCA) and cluster analysis
- 224 PCA analysis based on concentrations of heavy metals in the seaweed species showed that about
- 225 79% of the total variance was explained by three PCs (Fig. 4). PC1 is mostly associated with Cu, Cr,
- and Pb, and explains 41 % of the total variance. *Gelidium divaricatum* shows the highest
- concentrations of Cr (6.83 mg/kg DW) and Pb (4.21 mg/kg DW) (Table 3). In addition to having the
- 228 highest Cu concentration (47.62 mg/kg DW) (Table 3), Pachydictyon coriaceum also has relative high
- concentrations of Cr (5.9 mg/kg DW) and Pb (3.34 mg/kg DW) (Table 3). This suggests that these two
- seaweed species are more sensitive to the bioaccumulation of Cu, Cr and Pb than other species,
- respectively. PC2 is mainly associated with Zn and Cd, explaining 23 % of the total variance. Gelidium
- divaricatum has the highest Zn concentration (134.50 mg/kg DW) (Table 3), Sargassum vachellianum
- has the highest Cd concentration (8.48 mg/kg DW) (Table 3), indicating that these two seaweed species
- are the most sensitive to the bioaccumulation of Zn and Cd, respectively. PC3 is clearly featured by As
- and explains 15 % of the total variance. Sargassum fusiforme shows the highest As concentration
- 236 (57.71 mg/kg DW) (Table 3), followed by Sargassum thunbergii (49.08 mg/kg DW) (Table 3),
- 237 reflecting that these two species are more sensitive to accumulate As compared with other seaweed
- species. According to the PCA, the pattern of heavy metal concentrations in seaweeds is determined in
- the order PC1 (Cu, Cr and Pb) > PC2 (Zn and Cd) > PC3 (As), and the concentrations of heavy metals
- 240 in the seaweed species are more closely related to species rather than location (sampling site). Cluster
- analysis reflects the similarity in distribution of heavy metals and hence the comprehensive
- bioaccumulation ability of seaweed species, which were divided into five groups (Fig. 5). For instance,

243	Gelidium divaricatum and Pachydictyon coriaceum are divided into the same group, showing that they
244	have similar elements distribution and bioaccumulation ability. This is consistent with the PCA result,
245	which demonstrates that both of them are sensitive to accumulate Cr and Pb. Similar finding is
246	presented in the group of Sargassum fusiforme and Sargassum thunbergii for the bioaccumulation of
247	As.
248	3.3.2 Bioaccumulation coefficient of heavy metal in seaweed species
249	The bioaccumulation coefficient showed that Pachydictyon coriaceum is the strongest
250	accumulator of Cu, Gelidium divaricatum of Cr and Pb, Sargassum vachellianum of Cd, Sargassum
251	fusiforme of As, and Laurencia tropica of Ni (Table 4). Thus, our data reveal seaweed species with the
252	strongest accumulation of particular elements. For instance, our findings that Sargassum has a high
253	ability to accumulate As are consistent to other studies, i.e. of Sargassum spp. in the Todos os Santos
254	Bay, Brazil (Brito et al. 2012). Moreover, Sargassum sp. has high potential biosorption capacity of Pb,
255	Zn, Cu and Ni (Sheng et al. 2004), in addition to our findings of its high accumulation capacity of Cd
256	and As. Therefore, our data suggest the identification of potential cosmopolitan bio-monitors for
257	several heavy metal elements. Similarly, in addition to Cu, Pachydictyon coriaceum has high
258	accumulation capacities for Cr and Pb. Other good potential cosmopolitan bio-monitors consist of (1)
259	Sargassum thunbergii for Cd and As, and (2) Pterocladiella capillacea for Cu and Ni.
260	Interspecific differences of bioaccumulation coefficient for heavy metals in seaweeds have
261	usually been attributed to the binding sites for elements (Stengel et al. 2004) and biochemical
262	composition (Malea and Kevrekidis 2014), which is determined by the species phylogeny (Hoek CVD
263	et al. 1995). However, even in the same seaweed species, the bioaccumulation coefficient is often
264	affected by the heavy metals concentrations in the coastal waters (Caixue et al. 2010; Ryan et al. 2012;

265	Zhang et al. 2014). Similarly, it seems as the Cu concentration in seawater influenced the
266	bioaccumulation coefficient, i.e. in the Liusha Bay, the Cu concentration of seawater was $12.3 \mu g/L$ and
267	the bioaccumulation coefficient of Sargassum thunbergii was 1788 (Caixue et al. 2010), while in this
268	study, the Cu concentration in seawater was 0.064 $\mu$ g/L, and the corresponding bioaccumulation
269	coefficient of Sargassum thunbergii was 20,016. Therefore, research efforts are needed for elements
270	and seaweed species where data are scarce or missing (Malea and Kevrekidis 2014), emphasizing the
271	importance of the current study in the East China Sea. Moreover, our data will also contribute to the
272	selection of bio-monitor species and the design of bio-monitoring programs over large geographical
273	areas, as well as the interpretation of bio-monitoring data for coastal environment protection and
274	management.
275	3.3.3 Selection of seaweed species for bio-monitoring
276	The phylogeny of seaweeds usually determine the biochemical composition and binding sites for
277	elements (Malea and Kevrekidis 2014) and thus contribute to the bioaccumulation coefficient of heavy
278	metals (Figs. 4 and 5, Table 4). Our result revealed that some species are better bio-monitors for certain
279	heavy metals. However, in coastal waters, the heavy metals are often present as multi-pollutions, rather
280	than a single element. Nevertheless, bioaccumulation studies focus mostly on the accumulation of
281	heavy metals from single metal solutions (Luna et al. 2010). Therefore, a better strategy of ecological
282	monitoring and accumulation would be to combine several seaweed species and measure several heavy
283	metals. The concept of using seaweed communities as bio-monitor has been applied in several
284	European countries, such as Spain, Poland, Germany, and Denmark, for early detection of increased
285	anthropogenic contaminations (Viana et al. 2010). Our results of the selective bioaccumulations of
286	certain heavy metals by local seaweeds, and the concept of using a suite of bio-monitors will allow

- 287 recognition of the presence and relative magnitude of heavy metal sources, and thus benefit the
- 288 establishment of novel monitoring program for heavy metal contaminated marine environment.

289 4. Conclusion

- 290 1. The seaweed richness of this survey follows the sequence of Rhodophyta > Phaeophyta >
- 291 Chlorophyta.
- 292 2. In the East China Sea, Phaeophyta are promising bio-monitor of Cd and As, as well as
- 293 Rhodophyta for Cu and Zn and Chlorophyta for Ni.
- 3. PCA and cluster analysis, together with the bioaccumulation coefficient, suggest that
- 295 Pachydictyon coriaceum, Gelidium divaricatum, Sargassum thunbergii and Pterocladiella capillacea
- have good potential to act as bio-monitors of heavy metals.
- 4. A single seaweed species does not reflect the comprehensive heavy metal pollutants in coastal
- 298 environment, and combining seaweed species posing different bioaccumulation capacities will benefit
- the bio-monitoring of heavy metals.
- 300 Acknowledgement
- 301 This study was supported by the National Key R and D Program of China (2016YFC1402104),
- 302 the National Natural Science Foundation of China (21677122), and the International Science and
- 303 Technology Cooperation Program of China (2015DFA01410). We acknowledge Mr. Junyu He, Ph. D.
- 304 candidate in Zhejiang University for his assistant in drawing Fig. 4.
- 305 Author contribution
- 306 Conceived and designed the analysis: X.X., T.W., Y.P. Sampled and identified the seaweed: T.W.,
- 307 T.D., X.X., Y.P., K.L., F.L., J.W., Y.Y. Wrote the paper: Y.P., X.X., M.H., T.W. All authors analyzed,
- 308 interpreted the results, and edited the manuscript.



Fig. 1 Field sampling sites (S1-S6) in Dongtou Islands, East China Sea (i.e., S1 represents the sampling site 1)





311 Fig. 2 The seaweed species with specimen photos from field sampling, and their distributions in the

312 tidal zones





Fig. 3 Average concentrations of heavy metal determined in three seaweed phyla - Rhodophyta,
Phaeophyta, and Chlorophyta, with the error bars showing the standard errors



**Fig. 4** PCA of the heavy metal concentrations of seaweed species. S1-S6 represent the sampling site 1

**318** to site 6



321 Fig. 5 Cluster analysis on the heavy metal concentrations of seaweed species using Ward grouping

322 method, B represents Phaeophyta (brown algae), R represents Rhodophyta (red algae), and G

323 represents Chlorophyta (green algae)

324 Table 1 Certified and detected tissue concentrations of heavy metals in the certified reference material

**325** Laver (GBW 10023)

Element	Certified concentration	Detected concentration	Recovery
Element	(mg/kg DW)	(mg/kg DW)	(%)
Cu	$12.200 \pm 1.100^{a}$	$11.490 \pm 0.020^{b}$	94
Cr	$2.400\pm0.400$	$2.250\pm0.030$	94
Ni	$2.250\pm0.180$	$2.190\pm0.040$	97
Zn	$28.000\pm2.000$	$28.170\pm0.020$	101
Pb	$2.050\pm0.150$	$1.980\pm0.040$	97
Cd	$0.570\pm0.050$	$0.580\pm0.010$	102
As	$27.000 \pm 6.000$	$26.890 \pm 0.060$	100

327 <sup>a</sup> The range of certified tissue concentrations of heavy metals

328 <sup>b</sup> Mean  $\pm$  standard error from three replicate detections

329 Table 2 Seaweed species collected in the Dongtou Islands, East China Sea

	Latitude (°N)	Longitude (°E)	Phylum	Species
SITE1	27.8588	121.1618	Phaeophyta	Sargassum fusiforme
SITE 2	27.8590	121.1824	Phaeophyta	Sargassum fusiforme
			Rhodophyta	Gracilaria lemaneiformis
			Chlorophyta	Ulva pertusa
SITE 3	27.8646	121.1872	Phaeophyta	Pachydictyon coriaceum
				Sargassum thunbergii
				Sargassum vachellianum
			Rhodophyta	Ahnfeltiopsis flabelliformis
				Laurencia tropica
				Pterocladiella capillacea
				Chondracanthus intermedius
SITE 4	27.8661	121.1901	Phaeophyta	Sargassum thunbergii
				Sargassum vachellianum
				Sargassum fusiforme
			Rhodophyta	Ahnfeltiopsis flabelliformis
				Polyopes polyideoides
				Gelidium divaricatum
				Pterocladiella capillacea
				Chondracanthus intermedius
SITE 5	27.8357	121.2325	Phaeophyta	Sargassum thunbergii
			Rhodophyta	Gelidium divaricatum
				Pterocladiella capillacea
				Laurencia tropica
				Chondracanthus intermedius
SITE 6	27.8329	121.2496	Phaeophyta	Sargassum thunbergii
				Sargassum vachellianum
				Sargassum fusiforme
			Rhodophyta	Polyopes polyideoides
				Gelidium divaricatum
				Chondracanthus intermedius

**Table 3** Mean Concentration (±SE) of heavy metal in seaweed species collected in the Dongtou Islands, East China Sea

Phylum	Species	Heavy metal concentration (mg/kg DW)						
		Cu	Cr	Ni	Zn	Pb	Cd	As
Phaeophyta	Sargassum fusiforme (n=5)	$7.93 \pm 0.89$	$0.85\pm0.11$	$2.87\pm0.38$	$20.87 \pm 6.69$	$1.50\pm0.62$	$1.71\pm0.17$	$57.71 \pm 13.4$
	Sargassum thunbergii (n=4)	$12.81\pm0.83$	$3.84\pm0.47$	$6.04\pm0.53$	$40.69 \pm 4.67$	$2.00\pm0.24$	$5.63\pm0.12$	$49.08\pm2.46$
	Sargassum vachellianum (n=3)	$8.59\pm0.23$	$1.21\pm0.12$	$3.11\pm0.38$	$81.03 \pm 12.90$	$1.90\pm0.39$	$8.48 \pm 0.29$	$23.77\pm3.88$
	Pachydictyon coriaceum (n=1)	47.62	5.9	5.23	61.22	3.34	3.19	16.12
Rhodophyta	Polyopes polyideoides (n=2)	$3.89\pm0.07$	$0.92\pm0.25$	$1.57\pm0.16$	$63.17 \pm 15.69$	$1.32\pm0.11$	$1.70\pm0.17$	$15.41\pm0.05$
	Gelidium divaricatum (n=3)	$23.76\pm0.40$	$6.83 \pm 1.11$	$6.58\pm0.34$	$134.50\pm40.88$	$4.21\pm0.64$	$1.56\pm0.30$	$8.89 \pm 1.07$
	Gracilaria lemaneiformis (n=1)	12.32	0.86	0.8	97.84	0.9	1.11	8.31
	Ahnfeltiopsis flabelliformis (n=2)	$11.47\pm0.82$	$1.16\pm0.03$	$4.85\pm0.18$	$32.25\pm2.27$	$1.09\pm0.09$	$1.93\pm0.11$	$4.81\pm0.74$
	Laurencia tropica (n=3)	$27.80 \pm 1.31$	$3.01\pm0.18$	$11.38 \pm 0.44$	$44.79 \pm 1.28$	$1.92\pm0.19$	$1.92\pm0.23$	$9.72\pm2.70$
	Pterocladiella capillacea (n=3)	$41.87\pm5.09$	$1.89\pm0.23$	$9.68\pm0.53$	$30.51 \pm 2.04$	$1.58\pm0.04$	$1.41\pm0.03$	$3.35\pm0.23$
	Chondracanthus intermedius (n=4)	$12.13\pm0.26$	$1.04\pm0.07$	$3.06\pm0.09$	$44.48 \pm 2.57$	$0.77\pm0.12$	$1.10\pm0.06$	$15.41\pm0.25$
Chlorophyta	<i>Ulva pertusa</i> (n=1)	11.68	2.05	7.14	51.74	2.18	1.09	7.35

**Table 4** Bioaccumulation coefficient of heavy metal in seaweed species collected in the Dongtou

335	Islands.	East	China	Sea
000	ioranao,	Dubt	China	Sea

Heavy metal	Cu	Cr	Ni	Pb	Cd	As		
concentration in seawater								
$(\mu g/L)^a$	0.640	0.700	0.670	0.032	0.036	1.430		
Sargassum fusiforme	12391	1214	4284	46875	47500	40357		
Sargassum thunbergii	20016	5486	9015	62500	156389	34322		
Sargassum vachellianum	13422	1729	4642	59375	235556	16622		
Pachydictyon coriaceum	74406	8429	7806	104375	88611	11273		
Polyopes polyideoides	6078	1314	2343	41250	47222	10776		
Gelidium divaricatum	37125	9757	9821	131563	43333	6217		
Gracilaria lemaneiformis	19250	1229	1194	28125	30833	5811		
Ahnfeltiopsis flabelliformis	17922	1657	7239	34063	53611	3364		
Laurencia tropica	43438	4300	16985	60000	53333	6797		
Pterocladiella capillacea	65422	2700	14448	49375	39167	2343		
Chondracanthus intermedius	18953	1486	4567	24063	30556	10776		
Ulva pertusa	18250	2929	10657	68125	30278	5140		

<sup>a</sup> The values are annual average value of heavy metal concentrations in seawater in 2015, from the

bulletin of coastal environment quality, released by the Ministry of Environment Protection, China

339

#### 340 Refences

- Ajjabi LC, Chouba L (2009) Biosorption of Cu<sup>2+</sup> and Zn<sup>2+</sup> from aqueous solutions by dried marine
   green macroalga Chaetomorpha linum Journal of Environmental Management 90:3485-3489
- Akcali I, Kucuksezgin F (2011) A biomonitoring study: heavy metals in macroalgae from eastern
   Aegean coastal areas Marine pollution bulletin 62:637-645
- Alhomaidan AA (2008) Accumulation of nickel by marine macroalgae from the Saudi coast of the
   Arabian Gulf Journal of Food Agriculture & Environment 6:148-151
- Areco MM, Dos SAM (2010) Copper, zinc, cadmium and lead biosorption by Gymnogongrus torulosus.
   Thermodynamics and kinetics studies Colloids & Surfaces B Biointerfaces 81:620-628
- Aydın-Önen S, Öztürk M (2017) Investigation of heavy metal pollution in eastern Aegean Sea coastal
   waters by using Cystoseira barbata , Patella caerulea , and Liza aurata as biological indicators
   Environmental Science and Pollution Research 24:1-25
- Ballesteros E, Torras X, Pinedo S, García M, Mangialajo L, De Torres M (2007) A new methodology
  based on littoral community cartography dominated by macroalgae for the implementation of
  the European Water Framework Directive Marine pollution bulletin 55:172-180
- Brito GB, De Souza TCL, Bressy FC, Moura CWDN, Korn MGA (2012) Levels and spatial
  distribution of trace elements in macroalgae species from the Todos os Santos Bay, Bahia,
  Brazil Marine Pollution Bulletin 64:2238-2244
- Caixue Z, Fujin B, Xingli S, Chun-Liang C (2010) Trace elements of spring and winter macroalgae in
   Liusha Bay Oceanologia et Limnologia Sinica 41:154-160 (in Chinese)
- Cazon JP, Bernardelli C, Viera M, Donati ER, Guibal E (2012) Zinc and cadmium biosorption by
   untreated and calcium-treated Macrocystis pyrifera in a batch system Bioresource Technology
   116:195-203
- Chakraborty S, Bhattacharya T, Singh G, Maity JP (2014) Benthic macroalgae as biological indicators
   of heavy metal pollution in the marine environments: A biomonitoring approach for pollution
   assessment Ecotoxicology and environmental safety 100:61-68
- Chaudhuri A, Mitra M, Havrilla C, Waguespack Y, Schwarz J (2007) Heavy metal biomonitoring by
   seaweeds on the Delmarva Peninsula, east coast of the USA Botanica Marina 50:151-158
- Hoek CVD, Mann DG, Jahns HM (1995) Algae: an introduction to phycology. UK: Cambridge
  University Press, UK
- Costa GB et al. (2016) Effects of copper and lead exposure on the ecophysiology of the brown seaweed
   Sargassum cymosum Protoplasma 253:111-125
- Davis TA, Volesky B, Mucci A (2003) A review of the biochemistry of heavy metal biosorption by
   brown algae Water Research 37:4311-4330
- Diez I, Santolaria A, Secilla A, Gorostiaga JM (2009) Recovery stages over long-term monitoring of
  the intertidal vegetation in the 'Abra de Bilbao' area and on the adjacent coast (N. Spain)
  European Journal of Phycology 44:1-14
- 377 Ding L, Huang B, Xie Y (2011) Advances and problems with the study of marine macroalgae of China
  378 seas Biodiversity Science 19:798-804 (in Chinese)
- Duan YH, Ning JS, Zhai YX, Shang DR, Zhao YF (2015) Effect of different digestion methods on the
   determination of inorganic elements in aquatic products by inductively coupled plasma mass
   spectrometry Journal of Food Safety & Quality
- 382 Elsikaily A, Nemr AE, Khaled A (2011) Copper sorption onto dried red alga Pterocladia capillacea and

- 383 its activated carbon Chemical Engineering Journal 168:707-714
- FAO (2017) FAO Yearbook Fishery and Aquaculture statistics. 2015 (Food and Agriculture
   Organization of the United Nations),
- Figueira P et al. (2016) Comparative study on metal biosorption by two macroalgae in saline waters:
   single and ternary systems Environmental Science and Pollution Research 23:11985-11997
- Fu FF, Akagi T, Yabuki S, Iwaki M, Ogura N (2000) Distribution of rare earth elements in seaweed:
   implication of two different sources of rare earth elements and silicon in seaweed Journal of
   Phycology 36:62-70
- Gao X, Chen CT (2012) Heavy metal pollution status in surface sediments of the coastal Bohai Bay
   Water Research 46:1901
- Giusti L (2001) Heavy metal contamination of brown seaweed and sediments from the UK coastline
   between the Wear river and the Tees river Environment International 26:275-286
- Gutierrez C, Hansen HK, Hernandez P, Pinilla C (2015) Biosorption of cadmium with brown
   macroalgae Chemosphere 138:164-169
- Hansen HK, Ribeiro AB, Mateus EP (2006) Biosorption of arsenic(V) with Lessonia nigrescens
   Minerals Engineering 19:486-490
- He J, Chen JP (2014) A comprehensive review on biosorption of heavy metals by algal biomass:
   Materials, performances, chemistry, and modeling simulation tools Bioresource Technology
   160:67-78
- 402 Ibrahim WM (2011) Biosorption of heavy metal ions from aqueous solution by red macroalgae Journal
   403 of Hazardous Materials 192:1827-1835
- Jayakumar R, Rajasimman M, Karthikeyan C (2015) Optimization, equilibrium, kinetic,
  thermodynamic and desorption studies on the sorption of Cu(II) from an aqueous solution
  using marine green algae: Halimeda gracilis Ecotoxicology & Environmental Safety
  121:199-210
- Jiang XJ, Gan WE, Han SP, Zi HJ, He YZ (2009) Design and application of a novel integrated
  electrochemical hydride generation cell for the determination of arsenic in seaweeds by atomic
  fluorescence spectrometry Talanta 79:314-318
- Juanes J, Guinda X, Puente A, Revilla J (2008) Macroalgae, a suitable indicator of the ecological status
   of coastal rocky communities in the NE Atlantic Ecological indicators 8:351-359
- 413 Kamalakannan S, Batvari BPD, Lee KJ, Kannan N, Krishnamoorthy R, Shanthi K, Jayaprakash M
  414 (2008) Assessment of heavy metals (Cd, Cr and Pb) in water, sediment and seaweed (Ulva
  415 lactuca) in the Pulicat Lake, South East India Chemosphere 71:1233-1240
- 416 Khristoforova NK, Kozhenkova SI (2002) The Use of the Brown Algae Sargassum spp. in Heavy
  417 Metal Monitoring of the Marine Environment near Vladivostok, Russia Ocean and Polar
  418 Research 24:325-329
- 419 Kravtsova A, Milchakova NA, Frontasyeva MV (2015) Levels, spatial variation and
  420 compartmentalization of trace elements in brown algae Cystoseira from marine protected
  421 areas of Crimea (Black Sea) Marine Pollution Bulletin 97:548-554
- Kumar JIN, Oommen C, Kumar RN (2009) Biosorption of heavy metals from aqueous solution by
   green marine macroalgae from Okha Port, Gulf of Kutch, India American-Eurasian Journal of
   Agricultural and Environmental Science:317-323
- La Rocha SRD, Sanchezmuniz FJ, Gomezjuaristi M, Marin MTL (2009) Trace elements determination
   in edible seaweeds by an optimized and validated ICP-MS method Journal of Food

427 Composition and Analysis 22:330-336 428 Li X, Titlyanov EA, Zhang J, Titlyanova TV, Zhang G, Huang H (2016) Macroalgal assemblage 429 changes on coral reefs along a natural gradient from fish farms in southern Hainan Island 430 Aquatic Ecosystem Health & Management 19:74-82 431 Luna AS, Costa ALH, Costa ACAD, Henriques CA (2010) Competitive biosorption of cadmium(II) 432 and zinc(II) ions from binary systems by Sargassum filipendula Bioresource Technology 433 101:5104-5111 434 Malea P, Kevrekidis T (2014) Trace element patterns in marine macroalgae Science of The Total 435 Environment:144-157 436 Mata YN, Blazquez ML, Ballester A, Gonzalez F, Munoz JA (2009) Biosorption of cadmium, lead and 437 copper with calcium alginate xerogels and immobilized Fucus vesiculosus Journal of 438 Hazardous Materials 163:555-562 439 MEP (2008) Specification for offshore environmental monitoring. HJ442-2008. (Ministry of 440 Environmental Protection of the People's Republic of China), 441 MEP (2015) Bulletin of environment quality for coastal waters of China (Ministry of Environmental 442 Protection of the People's Republic of China), 443 Murphy V, Hughes H, Mcloughlin P (2007) Cu(II) binding by dried biomass of red, green and brown 444 macroalgae Water Research 41:731-740 445 Paraskevi M, Anastasia C, Theodoros K (2015) Trace element seasonality in marine macroalgae of 446 different functional-form groups Marine Environmental Research 103:18-26 447 Pavasant P, Apiratikul R, Sungkhum V, Suthiparinyanont P, Wattanachira S, Marhaba TF (2006) 448 Biosorption of Cu2+, Cd2+, Pb2+, and Zn2+ using dried marine green macroalga Caulerpa 449 lentillifera Bioresource Technology 97:2321-2329 450 Pinedo S, García M, Satta MP, De TM, Ballesteros E (2007) Rocky-shore communities as indicators of 451 water quality: a case study in the Northwestern Mediterranean Marine Pollution Bulletin 55:126-135 452 453 Rainbow PS (1995) Biomonitoring of heavy metal availability in the marine environment Marine 454 Pollution Bulletin 31:183-192 Reis PA, Cassiano J, Veiga P, Rubal M, Sousa-Pinto I (2014) Fucus spiralis as monitoring tool of metal 455 contamination in the northwest coast of Portugal under the European Water Framework 456 457 Directives Environmental monitoring and assessment 186:5447-5460 458 Reis PA et al. (2016) Seaweed Alaria esculenta as a biomonitor species of metal contamination in 459 Aughinish Bay (Ireland) Ecological Indicators 69:19-25 460 Reis PA, Salgado MA, Vasconcelos V (2011) Barnacles as biomonitors of metal contamination in 461 coastal waters Estuarine Coastal & Shelf Science 93:269-278 462 Ryan S, McLoughlin P, O'Donovan O (2012) A comprehensive study of metal distribution in three 463 main classes of seaweed Environmental pollution 167:171-177 464 Sawidis T, Brown MT, Zachariadis GA, Sratis I (2001) Trace metal concentrations in marine macroalgae from different biotopes in the Aegean Sea Environment International 27:43-47 465 Scherner F et al. (2013) Coastal urbanization leads to remarkable seaweed species loss and community 466 467 shifts along the SW Atlantic Marine Pollution Bulletin 76:106-115 468 Schintu M, Marras B, Durante L, Meloni P, Contu A (2010) Macroalgae and DGT as indicators of 469 available trace metals in marine coastal waters near a lead-zinc smelter Environmental 470 monitoring and assessment 167:653-661

- 471 Sheng PX, Ting Y, Chen JP, Hong L (2004) Sorption of lead, copper, cadmium, zinc, and nickel by
  472 marine algal biomass: characterization of biosorptive capacity and investigation of
  473 mechanisms Journal of Colloid and Interface Science 275:131-141
- 474 Stengel DB, Macken A, Morrison L, Morley N (2004) Zinc concentrations in marine macroalgae and a
  475 lichen from western Ireland in relation to phylogenetic grouping, habitat and morphology
  476 Marine Pollution Bulletin 48:902-909
- Tamilselvan N, Hemachandran J, Thirumalai T, Sharma CV, Kannabiran K, David E (2013)
  Biosorption of heavy metals from aqueous solution by Gracilaria corticata varcartecala and
  Grateloupia lithophila Journal of Coastal Life Medicine 1:102-107
- Tseng CK, Chang CF (1959) On the economic marine algal flora of the Yellow Sea and the East China
  Sea Oceanologia Et Limnologia Sinica 1:43-52
- Varma R, Turner A, Brown MT (2011) Bioaccumulation of metals by Fucus ceranoides in estuaries of
   South West England Marine Pollution Bulletin 62:2557-2562
- Viana I, Aboal J, Fernández J, Real C, Villares R, Carballeira A (2010) Use of macroalgae stored in an
   Environmental Specimen Bank for application of some European Framework Directives
   Water research 44:1713-1724
- Vijayaraghavan K, Jegan J, Palanivelu K, Velan M (2005) Biosorption of copper, cobalt and nickel by
   marine green alga Ulva reticulata in a packed column Chemosphere 60:419-426
- Wang Z, Wang X, Ke C (2014) Bioaccumulation of trace metals by the live macroalga Gracilaria
  lemaneiformis Journal of Applied Phycology 26:1889-1897 doi:10.1007/s10811-013-0222-1
- 491 Xiao X et al. (2017) Nutrient removal from Chinese coastal waters by large-scale seaweed aquaculture
   492 Scientific Reports 7
- 493 Yipmantin A, Maldonado H, Ly M, Taulemesse JM, Guibal E (2011) Pb(II) and Cd(II) biosorption on
  494 Chondracanthus chamissoi (a red alga) Journal of Hazardous Materials 185:922-929
- Zhang Y, Li Y, Shi F, Sun X, Lin G (2014) Seasonal and spatial variation in species diversity,
  abundance, and element accumulation capacities of macroalgae in mangrove forests of
  Zhanjiang, China Acta Oceanologica Sinica 33:73-82