

# **A new ichnofauna from the Permian of the Zat Valley in the Marrakech High Atlas of Morocco**

Jean-David Moreau, Naima Benaouiss, Abdelilah Tourani, J.-Sébastien Steyer, Michel Laurin, Karin Peyer, Olivier Bethoux, Ali Aouda, Nour-Eddine Jalil

# **To cite this version:**

Jean-David Moreau, Naima Benaouiss, Abdelilah Tourani, J.-Sébastien Steyer, Michel Laurin, et al.. A new ichnofauna from the Permian of the Zat Valley in the Marrakech High Atlas of Morocco. Journal of African Earth Sciences, 2020, pp.103973. 10.1016/j.jafrearsci.2020.103973. mnhn-02922570

# **HAL Id: mnhn-02922570 <https://mnhn.hal.science/mnhn-02922570>**

Submitted on 5 Sep 2022

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



[Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/)

Version of Record: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1464343X20302247> Manuscript\_b5fcbd532d76d43d6ef0c25ad87a5415

# **A new ichnofauna from the Permian of the Zat Valley in the Marrakech**

# **High Atlas of Morocco**

- 4 Jean-David Moreau<sup>a\*</sup>, Naima Benaouiss<sup>b</sup>, Abdelilah Tourani<sup>b</sup>, J.-Sébastien Steyer<sup>c</sup>, Michel
- 5 Laurin<sup>c</sup>, Karin Peyer<sup>c</sup>, Olivier Béthoux<sup>c</sup>, Ali Aouda<sup>d</sup>, Nour-Eddine Jalil<sup>b, c</sup>

- <sup>a</sup> UMR CNRS 6282 Biogéosciences, Université de Bourgogne Franche-Comté, 6 boulevard
- Gabriel, 21000 Dijon, France.
- <sup>b</sup> Département de géologie, Faculté des Sciences Semlalia, Université Cadi Ayyad, BP 2390,
- Marrakech 40000, Morocco.
- 11 Centre de Recherches en Paléontologie Paris (CR2P), UMR 7207,
- CNRS/MNHN/SU/EPHE, Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle, Paris, France.
- 13 d'Laboratoire des études sur les ressources, la mobilité et l'attractivité, Faculté des lettres et des
- Sciences Humaines, Université Cadi Ayyad, rue Amarchich, Marrakech 40000, Morocco.
- \* Corresponding author; e-mail address: jean.david.moreau@gmail.com

# **Abstract**

- A new ichnofauna from the Permian of Morocco is described in details: it is the first
- Palaeozoic ichnofauna from the Zat Valley in Marrakech High Atlas. The new tracksite was
- found in the Tighdouine region, in the middle-upper Permian of the Cham-el-Houa Siltstone
- Formation. An abundant and diverse ichnoassemblage composed of both protostomian
- (probably arthropods and annelids) traces and vertebrate tracks is recorded. The presence of
- protostomian burrows and traceways, associated with tetrapod tracks corresponds to the



- Lucas, 2018, but see Steyer, 2000 for biostratigraphy using bodyfossils). Many Permian
- tracksites are located in Europe (e.g. Haubold and Sarjeant, 1973; Gand and Haubold, 1984;
- Demathieu et al., 1992; Gand, 1993; Gand et al., 1997, 2000; Voigt, 2005; Gand and Durand,

2006; Voigt et al., 2012; Marchetti, 2016; Mujal et al., 2016; Marchetti et al., 2017a), Africa (De Beer, 1986; Smith, 1993; de Klerk, 2002; Steyer et al., 2007; Smith et al., 2015; Marchetti et al., 2019a), Asia (Gand et al., 2011), Australia (Warren, 1997), North America (Mossman and Place, 1989; van Allen et al., 2005; Minter et al., 2007; Lucas et al., 2001, 2004; Marchetti et al., 2019b) and South America (Melchor and Sarjeant, 2004; da Silva et al., 2012; Francischini et al., 2018).

In Morocco, the Permian deposits are broadly exposed in many graben structures forming isolated basins (e.g. Broutin et al., 1998). Some of them yielded abundant and diverse tetrapod bodyfossils (e.g., Dutuit, 1976, 1988; Jalil and Dutuit, 1996; Jalil, 1999; Jalil and Janvier, 2005; Germain 2010; Steyer and Jalil, 2009, Khaldoune et al., 2017). Permian tetrapod tracksites are found in the Argana Basin (Voigt et al., 2010; Hminna et al., 2012), the Khenifra Basin (Hmich et al., 2006; Voigt et al., 2011a) and the Tiddas Basin (Voigt et al., 2011b). Recently, we discovered a new tracksite in the Cham-el-Houa Siltstone Formation near Tighdouine, in the eastern-northeastern part of the Zat Valley in Marrakech High Atlas, where Permian deposits are cropping out (Perez et al., 2019). It constitutes the first Permian tracksite from this area. Here, we describe in details this new ichnoassemblage and its sedimentological context in order to discuss the palaeoecosystem and palaeoenvironment of the Cham-el-Houa Siltstone Formation.

# **2. Geographical and geological setting**

The new tracksite is located in the Marrakech High Atlas (Fig. 1A), western side of the Zat Valley; more precisely in the Tighdouine region, near the village of Al Bour (Fig. 1B and 1C). This area is bounded by the Ourika-Zat Palaeozoic peri-anticline termination to the

SE and the Triassic strata to the NW. The occurrence of Carboniferous outcrops (Visean and Stephanian) allows to examine post-Hercynian structures (Permian pre-rift) and their relationships with older Hercynian structures, such as a NE-SW schistosity and fold axis. The Hercynian overlaps are posterior to the schistosity. The Marrakech High Atlas contains several Permian basins, which overly the deformed Variscan basement, represented mainly, in the studied area, by Carboniferous mudstones. This basement is affected by the NNE-SSW to NW-SE and E-W folds (Jenny, 1983; Cornée, 1989). The Atlasic orogeny consists of Permian-Triassic to Early Jurassic distensional movement and Late Cretaceous compressive movements. These Permian basins of the Marrakech High Atlas are described as pre-rift strata (Olsen et al., 2000) and may be due to extensional tectonics (Perez et al., 2019). The Permian basin of the Tighdouine area is composed of continental deposits that are up to 160 m thick (Fig. 1). These deposits rest unconformably on Stephanian strata and are 83 unconformably covered by Triassic series (Fig. 1C). The western lateral equivalent of these Tighdouine Permian strata corresponds to the Cham-el-Houa Siltstone Formation or F2 Formation *sensu* Biron (1982), identified in the Ourika and Gadji Valleys. The ichnofossils

described here were discovered *ex-situ* on large blocks lying in a Quaternary alluvial debris-

flow fan (Fig. 1C) but had come from a cliff composed of the Tighdouine Permian strata.

#### **3. Material and methods**

#### *3.1. Sedimentological analysis*

The tracksite was discovered in 2018 during a palaeontological fieldtrip organised by the MNHN (Paris, France) and the University Cadi Ayyad (Marrakech, Morocco) in the

Tighdouine region. In order to determine the stratigraphic origin of the tracks and to characterise their depositional environments, a sedimentological analysis was conducted along the 58-m-thick stratigraphic section accessible in the drainage basin of the Quaternary fan (Figs. 1C and 2). The reconstruction of the depositional environment was established through detailed facies and facies association analyses of the entire stratigraphic section. Comparisons with facies of the *ex-situ* track-bearing blocks allowed to locate precisely the track-bearing beds in the section (Fig. 2). The facies codes were completed according to Miall (1978) and Postma (1990). The interpretation of depositional facies was based on analogous modern dryland environments (Tooth, 2000a, b; Billi, 2007; North et al., 2007) and on facies model of fluvial distributary systems (Nichols and Fisher, 2007; Fisher et al., 2007; Sáez et al., 2007; Cain and Mountney, 2009; Burns et al., 2017, 2019; Gulliford et al., 2017).

#### *3.2. Ichnological analyses*

The palaeoichnological material from Tighdouine includes both protostomian (probably arthropods and annelids) traces and tetrapod tracks. Tetrapod ichnofossils include more than 70 tracks. They are preserved on five large *ex situ* isolated blocks found in the debris-flow fan. The largest blocks (up to 2.2 m wide) bear four distinct palaeoichnological assemblages labelled P.As-A to P.As-D. Assemblages A, B and D are preserved as convex hyporeliefs (one block per assemblage) whereas Assemblage C includes convex hyporeliefs as well as concave epireliefs and is preserved on two blocks. Additionally, numerous slabs were collected: they are currently housed in the palaeontological collections of the Muséum d'Histoire Naturelle de Marrakech, Morocco (hereafter MHNM). All blocks and slabs bearing tracks consist of fine-grained reddish siltstone. The track-bearing surfaces often show mudcracks forming large polygons (up to 60 cm wide), microbial mats, as well as ripple



## *3.3. Taxonomic nomenclature*

The name "Tetrapoda" refers to different taxa, according to the way these are conceptualised. Traditionally in palaeontology, this name refers to an apomorphy-based taxon defined by the occurrence of digited limbs, or a suite of characters states including digited limbs. However, it is implicitly understood as a crown-clade taxon (i.e. excluding stem-groups) in the bulk of the neontological nomenclature (Laurin and Anderson, 2004); thus, this concept is explicitly formalised under the precepts of the PhyloCode (see Laurin, 2020 a; and references therein). Concurrently, the name "Stegocephali" is formally defined to correspond closely with the clade of limbed vertebrates (see Laurin, 2020 b; and reference therein). In summary, the taxon encompassing all vertebrate taxa (extinct and extant) sharing digited limbs (including those who lost them) can be referred to either as "Tetrapoda" or "Stegocephali". To prevent confusion, and with regard to the adopted consensus in

palaeoichnology, we agreed to use the former, under its apomorphy-based concept. Rather than using "invertebrate traces" we preferred "protostomian traces", which is more accurate. 

**4. Results** 

# *4.1. Stratigraphy and sedimentology of the tracksite*

The new tracksite originates from the middle-upper section of the F2 Formation (Fig. 1C): this section is mainly characterised by fine-grained facies interbedded with silty and fine sandy facies. The lower part of the section is more sandy than the upper part. The study of the facies and facies associations allows to subdivide the section into three units (Fig. 2): - Unit 1 (14.5 m thick) is characterised mainly by (1) sandstones and (2) heterolithic beds. (1) The sandstones show rough trough-cross bedding (St facies), coarse planar-cross bedding (Sp facies) to massive structure (Sm facies) and are topped by current ripple cross-laminated sandstone (Sr facies), which is associated to *Scoyenia* burrows (Fig. 2). The facies associations "St-Sr" and "Sm-Sp-Sr", both 8 m thick, characterise stacked channel deposits (Fig. 2A) and are associated to *Scoyenia* burrows (Fig. 2B) at their top. (2) The heterolithic beds, at the top of unit 1, are 3.5 m thick. They are dominated by massive and ripple cross-laminated, up to 25 cm thick, fine sandstone beds (Sm and Sr facies) that coarsen and thicken, and then fine upward (Fig. 2A). The subordinate cm- to dm-thick silty claystone layers display a massive structure (Fm facies). The lateral accretion beds dip gently, on average, to the west or to the east and evolve laterally into fine sediments. The upper part of the heterolithic facies displays sometimes WNW-ESE axis scoured troughs, infilled with sets of normally graded bedding (Fig. 2A). All these features reveal levee deposits.

- Unit 2 (28 m thick) shows four facies associations. (1) Medium to fine sandstone beds are 1.5 to 3.0 m thick and 24 to 80 m wide. They are characterised by erosive base and irregular top, with mainly massive (Sm facies) to subordinate rough trough-cross bedding (St facies) and ripple cross-lamination (Sr facies) at their top. This facies association characterises channel deposits. (2) Medium sandstone and siltstone beds are composed of planar cross bedding (Sp facies) and ripple cross-lamination (Sr facies). The low-angle inclined lateral accretion surfaces of beds are toward ENE or WSW, forming long belts of up to several hundred meters. These surfaces isolate sigmoidal shape foresets (epsilon cross bedding). The upper surface of sandstone bodies is irregular with ridges and swales topography (Fig. 2C). The depositional environment was mid-point bars and upper point bars. (3) Heterolithic strata are composed of massive or horizontally laminated very fine sandstones to siltstones (Sm, Sh facies) and of fine-grained sediments. These latter are characterised by interlaminated siltstone and claystones (Fl facies) or massive claystone (Fm facies) associated to mm-size carbonate nodules and mottled fabric. This facies association sometimes shows a coarsening and thickening upward trend. In transverse section, it includes WSW or ENE lateral accretion (Fig. 2C). Plant macroremains (Fig. 2D), microbial mats (Fig. 2E) and some scoured troughs are present. Plants consist of conifer leafy axes preserved as impressions without cuticles. This facies association corresponds to levee deposits. (4) The wedge-shaped fine sandstones to siltstones present horizontal bedding with E-W parting lineation (Sh facies) or ripple-cross lamination (Sr facies) indicating a northward palaeocurrent. The longitudinal cross-section of these sandy bodies (60 to 100 m long) documents their wing or wedge geometric relationship with adjacent 10 to 40 m wide channels (Fig. 2F). The fourth facies association is interpreted as crevasse splay deposits. Unit 2 is mainly characterised by heterolithically stratified crevasse splay and levee deposits. All palaeocurrent measurements (from Sp/Sr facies, lateral accretion, trough axis of erosion in levees and parting lineation) converge on the same

preferential SSE-NNW meandering channel palaeoflow direction, with WSW-ENE point bar or levee lateral accretion and W-E to N expansion crevasse splay.

- Unit 3 (15.5 m thick) is characterised by mudstone interbedded with very fine-grained sandstone to siltstone (Fig. 2G). (1) The fine-grained facies, up to 10 m thick, is mainly massive (Fm facies) and associated with carbonate nodules and hydromorphic palaeosols. This facies is sometimes bioturbated. (2) The thin sandy and silty beds are up to 50 cm thick and up to 80 m of lateral extent. They are mainly composed of climbing ripple cross-lamination (Sr facies; Fig. 2H) and more rarely of horizontal lamination (Sh facies) and present a massive structure (Sm facies). These facies associations characterise distal crevasse splays. The palaeocurrents are directed toward the north. The unit 3 facies associations are typical of distal floodplain deposits that evolve locally to ponds, as attested by swimming tetrapod tracks, small wave ripples, syneresis cracks (Fig. 2I) and microbial mats (Fig. 2E).

*4.2. Systematic palaeoichnology* 

*4.2.1. Traces of protostomians* 

- *Diplichnites* Dawson, 1873
- *Diplichnites gouldi* Gevers et al., 1971

Fig. 3A–B

- *Material.* MHNM.ZAT.01, slab with three traceways preserved as convex hyporeliefs.
- MHNM.ZAT.14a, slab with one traceway preserved as convex hyporelief. MHNM.ZAT.18,
- slab with several traceways preserved as convex hyporeliefs.

*Description.* Traceways are simple, straight to curved and consist of two parallel rows of numerous and elongated appendage imprints that are regularly arranged and commonly oriented perpendicular to the traceway midline but can be inclined at up to 65°. Traceways are up to 13 cm long. External traceway width is 6–14 mm, whereas internal traceway width is 2- 6 mm. Traces of appendages are closely spaced, consecutive imprints being separated by a distance of up to 2.5 mm. Traces of appendages are up to 3 mm long, up to 2 mm wide and sometimes show a bifid end.

*Remarks.* As suggested by Minter et al. (2007), the taxonomy of *Diplichnites* and close

relatives (e.g. *Acripes, Asaphoidichnus, Lineatichnus, Merostomichnites, Multipodichnus,* 

*Pentapodichnus, Petalichnus, Protichnites, Tasmanadia, Trachomatichnus* and *Umfolozia*) needs to be revised. Although the oldest report of *Diplichnites gouldi* is Ordovician in age (Buatois et al., 1998; Retallack, 2009) the ichnospecies was reported from several Permian tracksites throughout the world (e.g. Minter et al, 2007; Avanzini et al., 2011a; Lucas et al., 2011; Marchetti et al., 2015).

*Diplopodichnus* Brady, 1947

*Diplopodichnus biformis* Brady, 1947

*Material.* MHNM.ZAT.01 and MHNM.ZAT.15, slabs including several traceways preserved as convex hyporeliefs.

*Description.* The slab MHNM.ZAT.01 bears several traceways, occasionally crossing and

running in different directions. The longest traceway is of 82 mm. Traceways are horizontal,

Fig. 3C–D



*Remarks.* The ichnogenus *Diplopodichnus* is reported from the Upper Proterozoic to the

Lower Jurassic (Buatois et al., 1998; Uchman et al., 2011 and references therein). *D. biformis* 

is widely recorded in Palaeozoic deposits including many occurrences in Permian formations

worldwide (e.g. Brady, 1947; Lucas et al., 2004, 2005; Contardi and Santi, 2009; Avanzini et

al., 2011a; Lima and Netto, 2012).

- *Scoyenia* White, 1929
- *Scoyenia* cf. *gracilis* White, 1929

Fig. 3E–F

*Material.* Several burrows on P.As-C.

*Description.* Burrows are unbranched, horizontally to vertically oriented in the sedimentary layer, straight to slightly curved, with prominently meniscate back-filled by the circular in cross-section and up to 20 mm in diameter.

*Remarks.* The specimens are preserved in cross section; longitudinal ridges commonly

observed on the surface of the burrow are not visible. *Scoyenia* is commonly observed in non-

marine formations yielding vertebrate trackways. In Morocco, this ichnotaxon was previously

- reported from several vertebrate tracksites of diverse Permian basins (e.g. Argana Basin,
- Hminna et al., 2012; Khenifra Basin, Hmich et al., 2006; Tiddas Basin, Voigt et al., 2011b).

*Spongeliomorpha* Saporta, 1887

#### *Spongeliomorpha carlsbergi* (Bromley & Asgaard, 1979)

Fig. 3G–H

*Material.*MHNM.ZAT.01 and MHNM.ZAT.15, slabs with several burrows preserved as convex hyporeliefs.

*Description.* Burrows are convex, mainly horizontally oriented in the sedimentary layer, sometimes oblique, cylindrical in cross section, irregularly curved. They are randomly arranged, simple to ramified, sometimes exhibiting a Y- or T-bifurcation. The longest specimen is of 60 mm. Burrows are 2–4 mm in diameter. The outer surface of the burrows shows a striate texture. Striae are very thin, up to 2 mm long, and obliquely to transversally oriented to the main axes of the burrow. Striae consist of convex ridges.

*Remarks.* The morphology of *Spongeliomorpha* is similar to those of *Steinichnus* (Bromley and Asgaard,1979)*.* Both consist of burrow networks with striated walls having dominantly transverse to oblique striae*.* The burrows from the Tighdouine tracksite are similar to the ichnospecies *Steinichnus carlsbergi* (Bromley and Asgaard, 1979) and *Spongeliomorpha milfordensis* (Metz, 1993), which have only been recorded in nonmarine settings (Melchor et al., 2009). Melchor et al. (2009) transferred *Steinichnus carlsbergi* to *Spongeliomorpha carlsbergi* and considered the ichnospecies *S. milfordensis* as a junior synonym of *Spongeliomorpha carlsbergi*, based on a similar range of orientation of striae. This report consists of the second occurrence of *Spongeliomorpha carlsbergi* in the Permian of Morocco. The ichnospecies was described from the middle to upper Permian Ikakerm Formation of the Argana Basin (Hminna et al., 2012).

### *4.2.2. Tracks of tetrapods*

- *Amphisauropus* Haubold, 1970
- *Amphisauropus* isp.

Fig. 4

*Material.* MHNM.ZAT.02, slab with four tracks preserved as convex hyporeliefs.

*Description.* The tracks consist of two plantigrade to semi plantigrade pes/manus sets (Fig. 4A–B). Pes and manus strides are 60 mm long. Pes and manus tracks from the same set form 290 a divergent angle of 30–35°. Pes imprints are pentadactyl, nearly as long as wide (; PL=4.0) cm, PW=4.0–4.4 cm; Fig. 4). The PL/PW ratio is equal to 0.9. Digit imprints are quite short, straight to curved and end in a small enlarged rounded tip. Digits I to V show a sub-parallel arrangement. Digit impressions increase in length from I to IV. Pes tracks show a short, large, rectangular sole with a fairly straight proximal margin (Fig. 4). Manus imprints are almost symmetrical, pentadactyl, and smaller than the pes tracks. They are twice as wide as long (ML=1.8 cm; MW=3.7–3.8 cm; ML/MW= 0.5; Fig. 4). Imprints of digits are very short and end in a small enlarged rounded tip. The traces of digit V is poorly imprinted or absent. The divarication angle of digits I-IV is equal to 90°.

*Remarks*. Although these tracks share some similarities with *Dolomitipes*, this ichnogenus differs in showing pedal imprint of similar size or slightly smaller than the manus, digit impressions I–IV length about 1/3 of the pes length, and manual imprint about one third wider than long (Marchetti et al. 2019a). Although these tracks share some features with *Merifontichnus*, this ichnogenus differs in showing manus and pes tracks with similar size and morphology, pes tracks clearly wider than long, and digits I–IV radially disposed (Gand et al., 2000; Marchetti, 2016). Frequently reported in the Lower Permian (e.g. Lucas et al., 2001; Santi and Krieger, 2001; van Allen et al., 2005; Avanzini et al., 2011b; Voigt et al., 2012),



*Erpetopus* Moodie, 1929

*Erpetopus* isp.

Fig. 5

*Material.* Thirty tracks. Thirteen preserved as convex hyporeliefs on P.As-A, fifteen as

concave epireliefs on MHNM.ZAT.03, and two as convex hyporeliefs on MHNM.ZAT.05.

*Description.* The tracks are small, plantigrade and consist of several isolated pes/manus sets

and two trackways. The longest trackway (on P.As-A) is 53 cm whereas the better preserved

one (MHNM.ZAT.03) is 16.0 cm long and 4.6 cm wide (Fig. 5A–B). Pes and manus track

stride is 3.8–4.9 cm long. The pes tracks are oriented inward, forming an acute angle of up to

 $327 \times 30^{\circ}$  with the trackway axis. The manus tracks are oriented forward, parallel with the trackway

axis.

Pes imprints are pentadactyl, as long as wide or slightly longer than wide, 9–15 mm long and

8–15 mm wide (Fig. 5C–I). The PL/PW ratio varies from 1.0 to 1.2. Digit imprints are thin,

elongated, curved and show sharp claw traces. Imprints of digits I-IV are curved inward whereas imprint of digit V is curved outward. The divarication angle of digits I-V varies from 55 to 100°. Pes tracks show a well-imprinted, rectangular and longer than wide sole (Fig. 5C– I).

Manus imprints are pentadactyl and smaller than pes tracks, wider than long or as wide as long (ML=5–8 mm, MW=6–12 mm; Fig. 5J–K). The ML/MW ratio varies from 0.7 to 1.2. Digit imprints are thin, elongated and distally curved. The impression of the digit IV is the longest. The divarication angle of digits I-V varies from 120 to 180°. Manus tracks show a very short sole (Fig. 5J–K). The manus tracks are commonly shallower than the pes tracks or entirely absent.

*Remarks*. Although these tracks share some similarities with *Procolophonichnium*, this

ichnotaxon differs in showing manus and pes of similar shape, and manus slightly longer than

wide (Marchetti et al, 2019c). The ichnogenus *Rhynchosauroides* differs from our tracks by

the presence of digitigrade pes tracks, and a larger size of the tracks (Voigt and Lucas, 2018).

*Erpetopus* was previously reported from lower and upper Permian deposits of many areas

including France (Haubold and Lucas 2003), Italy (Haubold and Lucas 2003; Marchetti et al.,

2013a, 2015) and USA (Minter et al., 2007; Marchetti et al., 2019b). In Africa, the

ichnogenus was only previously reported from the middle to upper Permian Ikakerm

Formation of the Argana Basin, Morocco (Hminna et al., 2012).

*Hyloidichnus* Gilmore, 1927

*Hyloidichnus* isp.

Fig. 6

*Material.* Eight tracks; six preserved as concave epireliefs on MHNM.ZAT.11, and two as convex hyporeliefs on P.As-D.

*Description.* Tracks are semi-plantigrade, pentadactyl, wider than long or as long (L=3.3–4.9 cm) as wide (W=4.0–5.0 cm; Fig. 6A–D). The L/W ratio varies from 0.7 to 1.1. Digit imprints are elongated, straight and end in a small enlarged rounded, sometimes bifurcated tip. The impression of digit IV is the longest. The digit V is weakly impressed. Digits I-V have a divarication angle of 82 to 95°. Tracks sometimes show a short sole with a straight to slightly concave proximal margin (Fig. 6C–D). *Remarks. Hyloidichnus* was reported from lower and upper Permian deposits of many localities throughout the world, in Argentina (Melchor and Sarjeant, 2004); France (e.g. Gand and Haubold, 1984; Gand, 1987; Demathieu et al., 1992; Gand and Durand, 2006); Italy (e.g. Marchetti et al., 2013b, 2015; Marchetti, 2016); Spain (Gand et al., 1997; Mujal et al., 2016); Turkey (Gand et al., 2011); and USA (Lucas et al., 2012; Voigt and Lucas, 2015, 2017). In Niger, possible *Hyloidichnus* trackways were reported from the ?middle to upper Permian (Steyer et al., 2007). In Morocco, the ichnogenus was previously reported from the middle to

upper Permian Ikakerm Formation in the Argana Basin, Morocco (Voigt et al., 2010; Hminna et al., 2012).

*Characichnos* Whyte & Romano, 2001

*Characichnos* isp.

Fig. 7

*Material.* Sixteen tracks. Six tracks preserved as both concave epireliefs and convex hyporeliefs on P.As-C. MHNM.ZAT.07 slab with a single track preserved as concave

epirelief. MHNM.ZAT.08 slab with seven further tracks preserved as concave epireliefs and MHNM.ZAT.09 slab with two tracks shown as concave epireliefs.

*Description.* The six tracks on P.As-C form a 81 cm long trackway. Tracks follow a 24.5–30

cm long stride (Fig. 7A). Outer and inner widths of trackway are 23 cm and 15 cm,

respectively. Tracks are more or less parallel to the trackway axis. Morphology and

dimensions of individual tracks vary a lot along the trackway: this is the case for example of

383 the length  $(L=17-70 \text{ mm})$  and the width  $(W=18-38 \text{ mm})$  of the tracks. Tracks show two to

four parallel, elongated, thin and straight to curved furrows of uniform width (Fig. 7B–M).

Some of the tracks show probable claw traces.

*Remarks.* The stratigraphic range of *Characichnos* is very large; from the lower Permian to

the Cretaceous (Whyte and Romano, 2001). This ichnogenus is reported from Permian

localities throughout the world (e.g. Argentina, Melchor and Sarjeant, 2004; Spain, Mujal et

al., 2016; USA, Lucas and Spielmann, 2009, Lerner and Lucas, 2015). Such tracks were

interpreted by several authors as scratches produced by the backward motion of the digits by a

partially buoyant tetrapod in shallow water (Whyte and Romano, 2001; Melchor and Sarjeant,

2004). Here, only the tips of the digits touched the substrate.

Undetermined tracks

Morphotype A

Fig. 8

*Material.* Five tracks preserved as convex hyporeliefs on P.As-B.

*Description.* P.As-B (Fig. 8A–B) includes a single pes/manus set (Fig. 8C–D). Pes imprints are semi-plantigrade, pentadactyl, and twice as wide (PW=5.0–5.4 cm) as long (PL=2.4–2.9; Fig. 8E–F). The PL/PW ratio is equal to 0.5. Digit imprints are very short, straight and end in an enlarged rounded tip. Digit V seems to be the shortest of the series, weakly impressed or lacking. The divarication angle of digits I-V is 121°. Pes tracks show a short, large and weakly impressed sole (Fig. 8E–F). Manus imprints are tetradactyl and almost as long (ML=4.9 cm) as wide (MW=4.6 cm; Fig. 8C–D). Digit imprints are short, straight and end in an enlarged rounded tip. Imprints of digits increase in length from I to IV. The divarication angle of digits I-IV is 120°.

Remarks. On manus tracks, impression of digit IV being the longest suggests that impression of digit V is missing. Although tracks of Morphotype A share some similarities with *Dolomitipes,* this ichnotaxon differs in showing pedal imprint longer than wide or about as wide as long, of similar size or slightly smaller than the manus (Marchetti et al. 2019a). Tracks of the Morphotype A also share some similarities with *Capitosauroides*. However, this ichnotaxon differs from Morphotype A in showing as long as wide pes tracks with relatively longer digits than those of manus tracks (Marchetti et al., 2019c). Given the partial preservation of these tracks, we refrain from assigning this material to an ichnogenus.

Morphotype B

Fig. 9

*Material.* Six tracks preserved as convex hyporeliefs on P.As-D.

*Description.* The tracks consist of plantigrade pes/manus sets (Fig. 9A–C). Pes imprints are

pentadactyl and longer than wide (PL= 5.0–7.8 cm; PW= 3.2–5.3 cm; PL/PW=1.3–1.6; Fig.

9A–C). The PL/PW ratio varies from 1.3-1.6. Digit imprints are mainly straight and only occasionally curved. The length of digits increases from I to IV. The divarication angle of digits I-V is up to 65°. A long heel impression is longer than half of the total length of the pes tracks. Manus imprints are tetradactyl, smaller than pes tracks, wider than long or as long (ML=3.7–5.0 cm) as wide (MW=2.8–3.7 cm) (Fig. 9A–C). The ML/MW ratio varies from 1.0 to 1.7. Digit imprints are curved to straight and end by an enlarged rounded tip. Digits increase in length from I to III.

*Remarks.* Morphotype B differs from Morphotype A by the presence of a long heel impression on pes tracks. It also differs by digit impressions which are not all straight (particularly on manus imprints) and not distally rounded (particularly on pes imprints). The presence of tetradactyl manus imprints is characteristic of the ichnogenera *Batrachichnus* and *Limnopus*. However, *Batrachichnus* is smaller than Morphotype B and in both ichnogenera *Batrachichnus* and *Limnopus,* impressions of digits are commonly distally rounded (Voigt and Lucas, 2018). Although tracks of the Morphotype B share some similarities with *Dolomitipes,* this ichnotaxon differs in showing pedal imprint of similar size or slightly smaller than the manus (Marchetti et al. 2019a).

```
439 5. Discussion
```


The age of the red beds of the Anrar Conglomerate Formation (F1) and the Cham-el-Houa Siltstone Formation (F2) from the Ourika-Zat anticline has been debated in the past

(Van-Houten, 1977; Biron, 1982). Due to the poorness of biostratigraphic data, these formations were tentatively dated from the upper Carboniferous to the Lias (see Biron, 1982 and references therein). Based on correlations with volcanic layers from neighbouring basins, Biron (1982) proposed that the formations F1 and F2 are lower Permian in age. However, Perez et al. (2019) recently performed Pb/U datations of the formations F1 and F2 based only on two samples (one by formation) they collected in the south-western part of the Ourika-Zat anticline, about 20 km west from the tracksite described here: in the sample from the F1, they identified high proportions of 250-270 Ma and 271-331 Ma zircons, the youngest being of  $247.8 \pm 7.2$  Ma, with a peak at around 264 Ma (=Capitanian according to the ICC, i.e. middle Permian). In the sample from the F2, they identified five zircons of 260-270 Ma, the youngest 455 being of  $266.3 \pm 3.9$  Ma (=Wordian according to the ICC, i.e. middle Permian). Although some zircons from the F2 are artefactually older than those from the underlying F1, the calculated ages of both F1 and F2 are mostly from the middle Permian, possibly upper Permian for the youngest zircons. This fits with the comparable middle to upper Permian age given to the Ikakern Formation (T1 and T2 units) of the Argana Basin. The ichnoassemblage reported by Hminna et al. (2012) from the upper member of the Ikakern Formation shares strong similarities with those we described here from the F2 Formation of the Zat Valley (co-occurrence of *Amphisauropus*, *Erpetopus, Dromopus*, *Scoyenia* and *Spongeliomorpha*).

## *5.2. Tracemakers and their palaeoenvironments*

The ichnoassemblage suggests that the fauna from Tighdouine was composed of various protostomians, especially arthropods. *Diplichnites gouldi, Scoyenia* cf. *gracilis* and *Spongeliomorpha carlsbergi* are characteristic of non-marine palaeoenvironments*.* 

*Diplichnites* is usually attributed to a locomotion trace of multi-limb arthropods such as crustaceans, myriapods, and euthycarcinoids (Minter et al., 2007). *Scoyenia* is interpreted as a feeding or a combined feeding and locomotion trace (burrow), produced by arthropods or annelids (Bromley and Asgaard, 1979; Frey et al., 1984). *Spongeliomorpha carlsbergi* is commonly interpreted as traces produced by burrowing insects (Melchor et al., 2009). The ichnospecies *Diplopodichnus biformis* was reported from non-marine to marginal marine environments and currently attributed to diplopods or other myriapods (Buatois et al., 1998).

The tetrapod tracks suggest that the fauna from Tighdouine was mainly composed of amniotes, and more specifically, reptiles. Only *Amphisauropus*, whose trackmakers are supposed to be seymouriamorphs (Haubold, 2000; Marchetti et al., 2017b), may correspond to anamniotic tetrapods. Trackmakers of *Erpetopus* are interpreted as small captorhinids or protorhothyridids (Haubold and Lucas, 2003; Bernardi and Avanzini, 2011). *Hyloidichnus* are usually referred to basal captorhinids (Gand, 1987) or possibly Moradisaurinae (Voigt et al., 2010). These supposed trackmakers (basal captorhinids, Moradisaurinae) are highlighted by bone remains in the contemporary Argana Basin (see Khaldoune et al., 2017 for a review).

The presence of protostomian burrows and traceways with tetrapod tracks matches the *Scoyenia* ichnofacies, which are interpreted as subaqueous freshwater sediments that are periodically emerged or as terrestrial substrates that are frequently inundated (Buatois and Mángano, 1995; Buatois et al., 1997). The co-occurrence of tetrapod tracks (both walking and swimming tracks), continental protostomian traces, mudcracks, ripple marks, as well as the lithological features of the track-bearing levels, confirm that the depositional environment was a fluvial zone periodically flooded and emerged. The presence of plant macro-remains indicates the relative proximity to forests or overgrown riverbanks. The depositional environments of the middle to upper part of the F2 Formation, around the tracksite, are characterised by a retrogradational trend. It evolves from fluvial deposits with stacked

channels of distal braided system (Unit 1) to meandering river, which records interstratified point bars / levees and channel depositional facies (Unit 2). The upper part (Unit 3) of this sedimentary evolution is marked by a distal floodplain, showing distal crevasse splays associated with local ponds. The studied tetrapod trackways are located in crevasse splays, levees and pond deposits.

**6. Conclusion** 

New ichnofossils from Tighdouine (Zat Valley) were discovered *ex-situ* in Permian blocks lying in a Quaternary alluvial debris-flow fan. These trace-bearing blocks come from the Cham-el-Houa Siltstone Formation or F2 *sensu* Biron (1982). A detailed sedimentological analysis confirms their stratigraphic origin: the new traces are considered to belong to the middle-upper Permian. They constitute the first report of a Palaeozoic ichnoassemblage in the Marrakech High Atlas and provide crucial information for the reconstruction of Permian ecosystems of Morocco. Protostomians traces (*Diplichnites gouldi, Diplopodichnus biformis, Scoyenia* cf. *gracilis* and *Spongeliomorpha carlsbergi*) are mainly attributed to diverse arthropods as well as possible annelids. The tetrapod tracks (*Amphisauropus*, *Characichnos*, *Erpetopus* and *Hyloidichnus*) suggest that the fauna from Tighdouine was mainly composed of sauropsid amniotes. The sedimentological analysis shows that this fauna lived in a palaeoenvironment evolving from braided-meandering systems to distal floodplains.

# **Acknowledgements**





Bernardi, M., Avanzini, M., 2011. Locomotor behavior in early reptiles: insights from an

unusual *Erpetopus* trackway. J. Paleontol. 85, 925–929.

- Billi, P., 2007. Morphology and sediment dynamics of ephemeral stream terminal distributary systems in the Kobo Basin (northern Welo, Ethiopia). Geomorphology 85, 98–113.
- Biron, P., 1982. Le Permo-Trias de la région de l'Ourika (Haut Atlas de Marrakech, Maroc).

Unpublished PhD diss. Université de Grenoble, France.

- Brady, L.F., 1947. Invertebrate tracks from the Coconino Sandstone of northern Arizona. J. Paleontol. 21, 466–472.
- Bromley, R., Asgaard, U., 1979. Triassic freshwater ichnocoenoses from Carlsberg Fjord, east Greenland. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 28, 39–80.
- Broutin, J., Aassoumi, H., El Wartiti, M., Freytet, P., Kerp, H., Quesada, C., Toutin-Morin,
- N., 1998. The Permian basins of Tiddas, Bou Achouch and Khenifra (central Morocco).
- Biostratigraphic and palaeophytogeographic implications. Mém. Mus. Nat. Hist.
- Nat. 179, 257–278.
- Buatois, L.A., Mángano, M.G., 1995. The paleoenvironmental and paleoecological
- significance of the lacustrine Mermia ichnofacies: an archetypical subaqueous
- nonmarine trace fossil assemblage. Ichnos 4, 151–161.
- Buatois, L.A., Mángano, M.G., Maples, C.G., 1997. The paradox of nonmarine ichnofaunas
- in tidal rhythmites; integrating sedimentologic and ichnologic data from the Late
- Cretaceous of eastern Kansas, USA. Palaios 12, 467–481.



- Demathieu, G., Gand, G., Toutin-Morin, N., 1992. La palichnofaune des bassins permiens provençaux. Geobios 25, 19–54.
- Dutuit, J.-M., 1976. Il est probable que les Rhynchocéphales sont représentés dans la faune du Trias marocain. C.R. Acad. Sci. Paris 283, 483–486.
- Dutuit, J.-M., 1988. *Diplocaulus minimus* n. sp. (Amphibia: Nectridea), Lépospondyle de la
- formation d'Argana dans l'Atlas occidental marocain. C.R. Acad. Sci. Paris 307, 851– 854.
- Fisher, J.A., Nichols, G.J., Waltham, D.A., 2007. Unconfined flow deposits in distal sectors

of fluvial distributary systems: examples from the Miocene Luna and Huesca Systems,

northern Spain. Sed. Geol. 195, 55–73.

- Francischini, H., Dentzien-Dias, P., Lucas, S.G., Schultz, C.L., 2018. Tetrapod tracks in Permo–Triassic eolian beds of southern Brazil (Paraná Basin). PeerJ 6: e4764; DOI 10.7717/peerj.4764.
- Frey, R.W., Pemberton, S.G., Fagerstrom, J.A., 1984. Morphological, ethological, and environmental significance of the ichnogenera *Scoyenia* and *Ancorichnus*. J. Paleontol.

58, 511–528.

Gand, G., 1987. Les traces de vertébrés tétrapodes du Permien français (paléontologie, stratigraphie, paléoenvironnements). Unpublished PhD diss. Université de Dijon, France.

Gand, G., 1993. La palichnofaune de vertébrés tétrapodes du bassin permien de Saint-

Affrique (Aveyron) : comparaisons et conséquences stratigraphiques. Géol. de la France 1, 41–56.



Paläoherpetologie 18, 1–124.

- Haubold, H., 2000, Tetrapodenfährten aus dem Perm Kenntnisstand und Progress 2000: Hallesches Jahrb. Geowiss. B 22,1–16.
- Haubold, H., Lucas, S.G., 2003. Tetrapod footprints of the lower Permian Choza formation at Castle Peak, Texas. Paläontol. Z. 77, 247–261.
- Haubold, H., Sarjeant, W.A.S., 1973. Tetrapodenfährten aus den Keele und Enville Groups
- (Permokarbon: Stefan und Autun) von Shropshire und South Staffordshire,
- Großbritannien. Z. Geol. Wiss. 1, 895–933.

- Hmich, D., Schneider, J.W., Saber, H., Voigt, S., El Wartiti, M., 2006. New continental
- Carboniferous and Permian faunas of Morocco: implications for biostratigraphy,

palaeobiogeography and palaeoclimate. Geol. Soc.Spe. Pub. 265, 297–324.

- Hminna, A., Voigt, S., Saber, H., Schneider, J.W., Hmich, D., 2012. On a moderately diverse continental ichnofauna from the Permian Ikakern Formation (Argana Basin, Western
- High Atlas, Morocco). J. African Earth Sci. 68, 15–23.
- Jalil, N.-E., 1999. Continental Permian and Triassic vertebrate localities from Algeria and
- Morocco and their stratigraphical correlations. J. African Earth Sci.29, 219–226.
- Jalil, N.-E., Dutuit, J.-M., 1996. Permian captorhinid reptiles from the Argana formation, Morocco. Palaeontology 39, 907–918.
- Jalil, N.-E., Janvier, P., 2005. Les pareiasaures (Amniota, Parareptilia) du Permien supérieur du Bassin d'Argana, Maroc. Geodiversitas 27, 35–132.
- Jenny, J., 1983. Zone de décrochement du Tizi-n-Test dans le Haut Atlas. Eclogae Geol. Helv. 76, 249–251.
- Khaldoune F., Jalil N.-E., Germain G., Steyer J.-S., 2017. Les vertébrés du Permien et du
- Trias du Maroc (Bassin d'Argana, Haut Atlas occidental) : fenêtre ouverte sur





- Robledo Mountains, Southern New Mexico. Bull. New Mexico Mus. Nat. Hist. Sci. 65,
- 141–152.

- Lima, J.H.D., Netto, R.G., 2012. Trace fossils from the Permian Teresina Formation at Cerro Caveiras (S Brazil). Rev. Bras. Paleontolog. 15, 5–22.
- Lucas, S.G., 2007. Tetrapod footprint biostratigraphy and biochronology. Ichnos 14, 5–38.
- Lucas, S.G., Spielmann, J.A., 2009. Tetrapod footprints from the Lower Permian Abo
- Formation near Bingham, Socorro County, New Mexico. New Mexico Geol. Soc. Guidebook 60, 299–304.
- Lucas, S.G., Lerner, A.J., Haubold, H., 2001. First record of *Amphisauropus* and *Varanopus*
- in the Lower Permian Abo Formation, central New Mexico. Hallesches Jahrb. Geowiss. B 23, 69–78.
- Lucas, S.G., Lerner, A.J., Hunt, A.P., 2004. Permian tetrapod footprints from the Lucero uplift, central New Mexico, and Permian footprint biostratigraphy. Bull. New Mexico Mus. Nat. Hist. Sci. 25, 291–300.
- Lucas, S.G., Smith, J.A., Hunt, A.P., 2005. Tetrapod tracks from the Lower Permian Yeso Group, central New Mexico. Bull. New Mexico Mus. Nat. Hist. Sci. 31, 121–124.
- Lucas, S.G., Voigt, S., Lerner, A.J., Nelson, W.J., 2011. Late early Permian continental

ichnofauna from Lake Kemp, north-central Texas, USA. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 308, 395–404.

- Lucas, S.G., Krainer, K., Chaney, D.S., DiMichele, W.A., Voigt, S., Berman, D.S., Henrici,
- A.C., 2012. The Lower Permian Abo Formation in the Fra Cristobal and Caballo
- mountains, Sierra County, New Mexico. New Mexico Geol. Soc. Guidebook 63, 345–
- 376.



Marchetti, L., Tessarollo, A., Felletti, F., Ronchi, A., 2017a. Tetrapod footprint paleoecology:

behavior, taphonomy and ichnofauna disentangled. A case study from the Lower Permian of the Southern Alps (Italy). Palaios 32, 506–527.

Marchetti, L., Mujal, E., Bernardi, M., 2017b. An unusual *Amphisauropus* trackway and its implication for understanding seymouriamorph locomotion. Lethaia 50, 162–174.

- Marchetti, L., Klein, H., Buchwitz, M., Ronchi, A., Smith, R.M.H., De Klerk, W.J., Sciscio
- L., Groenewald, G.H.,2019a. Permian-Triassic vertebrate footprints from South Africa:
- Ichnotaxonomy, producers and biostratigraphy through two major faunal crises.
- Gondwana Res. 72, 139–168.





Sandstone, Holy Cross Mountains, Poland. Acta Palaeontol. Pol. 49, 289–320.



- Sáez, A., Anadón, P., Herrero, M.J., Moscariello, A., 2007. Variable style of transition between Palaeogene fluvial fan and lacustrine systems, southern Pyrenean foreland, NE Spain. Sedimentology 54, 367–390. Santi, G., Krieger, C., 2001. Lower Permian tetrapod footprints from Brembana Valley-Orobic Basin (Lombardy, Northern Italy). Rev. Paléobiol. 20, 45–68. Smith, R.M., 1993. Sedimentology and ichnology of floodplain paleosurfaces in the Beaufort Group (Late Permian), Karoo sequence, South Africa. Palaios 8, 339–357. Smith, R.M., Sidor, C.A., Tabor, N.J., Steyer, J.-S., 2015. Sedimentology and vertebrate taphonomy of the Moradi Formation of northern Niger: a Permian wet desert in the tropics of Pangaea. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 440, 128–141. Steyer, J.-S., 2000. Are European Paleozoic amphibians good stratigraphical markers? Bull. Soc. Géol. France 171, 127–135. Steyer, J.-S., Gand, G., Smith, R., Sidor, C., Tabor, N., 2007. The first tetrapod trackways from the Paleozoic of West Africa: one step towards reconstructing the landscape of central Pangea. J. Vertrebr. Paleontol. 27, 152A. Steyer, J.-S., Jalil, N.-E., 2009. First evidence of a temnospondyl in the Late Permian of the Argana Basin, Morocco. Spec. Pap. Palaeontol. 81, 155–160.
	- Tooth, S., 2000a. Downstream changes in dryland river channels: the Northern Plains of arid central Australia. Geomorphology 34, 33–54.
	- Tooth, S., 2000b. Process, form and change in dryland rivers: a review of recent research.
	- Earth-Sci. Rev. 51, 67–107.





## **Figure captions**



**Figure 2**. Detailed sedimentary section and outcrop photographs of the middle to upper part of the Permian F2 Formation in the western bank of the Zat Valley. The stratigraphic position of the ichnofossils is indicated by symbols. A, Stacked channels (CH) superimposed by levee architectural element (Lv), with progradational and retrogradational trend. The erosional event appears at the top as infilled trough with graded beds (dashed line). B, *Scoyenia*  burrows (Sc) at the top of channels, common in the lower and upper parts of the section. C, Juxtaposed point bars (Pb) of the unit 2 lower part, showing ridges and swales topography in 852 their upper surface. Levee beds (Lv) with lateral accretion to the left indicated by white dashed lines. D, Conifer leafy axes mainly found in levee depositional facies. E, Crinkled surface (Cr) of microbial mats observed in levee, crevasse splay and pond deposits, associated with syneresis cracks (Sy). F, Outcrop aspect of channel bodies (CH) and lateral wing

crevasse splays (Cp) interbedded with heterolithic facies crevasse splay/levee (Cp/Lv). G, 857 Outcrop of unit 3 upper part with silty distal crevasse splay (Cp) in distal floodplain. H, Climbing ripples in crevasse splay. I, mm-size syneresis cracks in pond deposits of unit 3.



**Figure 4.** *Amphisauropus* isp. A–B, Siltstone slab bearing two successive pes/manus sets 867 preserved as convex hyporeliefs; photograph (A) and interpretative sketch (B). C–D, 868 Pes/manus set; photograph (C) and interpretative sketch (D). MHNM.ZAT.02. All scale bars 869 = 1 cm.



876 **Figure 6.** *Hyloidichnus* isp. A–B, Siltstone slab bearing several tracks; photograph (A) and 877 interpretative sketch (B). C–D, Detail of tracks; photograph (C) and interpretative sketch (D). 878 Scale bars:  $A-B = 2$  cm.

879



886

887 **Figure 8.** Morphotype A. A–B, Surface of the slab P.As-B showing several tracks preserved 888 as convex hyporeliefs; photograph (A) and interpretative sketch (B). C–D, Pes/manus set; 889 photograph (C) and interpretative sketch (D). Pes track; photographs (E) and digital elevation 890 models in false colors and contours  $(F)$ . Scale bars:  $A-B = 10$  cm;  $C-F = 1$  cm.

891

892 **Figure 9.** Morphotype B. Pes/manus set preserved as convex hyporeliefs on P.As-D;

- 893 photograph (A), digital elevation model in false colors and contours (B) and interpretative
- 894 sketch (C). Scale bars:  $A-C = 1$  cm.





Rootlets  $\lambda$ 

Crinkled  $\implies$ 

Mudcracks ~

Scoyenia <

Plant remains 稳 Vertebrate tracks Mg

3.  $\sf B$ G F  $H$ 

























